# Passive terahertz imaging with superconducting antenna-coupled microbolometers

Arttu Luukanen MilliLab/VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland arttu.luukanen@vtt.fi www.vtt.fi/millilab

Leif Grönberg, VTT Panu Helistö, VTT Felix Maibaum, VTT/PTB Heikki Seppä, VTT Jari S. Penttilä, VTT Hannu Sipola, VTT Tekes, the Finnish Funding Agency for Technology and Innovation (Decision #40384/05) Rapiscan Systems *Erich Grossman, NIST, Boulder, CO* (grossman@boulder.nist.gov) *Charles Dietlein, UC Boulder,CO Zoya Popovic, UC Boulder, CO* NIST/Office of Law Enforcement Standards UC Boulder/ NSF, award #0501578





Rapiscan Systems Oxford Instruments

# Outline

- Terahertz radiation characteristics
- Application stand-off detection of concealed weapons & explosives
  - Passive vs active modalities
  - Indoors vs outdoors
- Existing technologies: signal-starved & expensive
- Introduction to bolometers
- Spectral imaging potential
- Experiments: Electrical & optical characteristics
- Single pixel raster scanned passive images
- New developments
  - NbN bolometers
  - Arrays
- Conclusions



#### Terahertz radiation?













#### **Terahertz radiation**

- Characterised by a wavelength ~100  $\mu$ m <  $\lambda$  < 1 mm (300 GHz < f < 3 THz, 14 K < T < 144 K, 1.2 meV < hv < 12 meV)
- Relatively good penetration through dielectric materials
- Focussing possible with reasonable (D<1 m) apertures
- No known health effects
- The spectral range contains a *vast* number of characteristic spectral lines that correspond to the torsional, rotational & twisting modes of molecules
  - Sharp spectral features only in low-pressure gases
  - Resonances are broad in solid materials & liquids
- Detection & generation (especially at ambient temperatures) remains a challenge ( $h_V \approx k_B T$ )





# The THz "gap"





graph courtesy of Tom Crowe (VDI/UVA)



IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

# Our goals

- Our short term goals:
  - To demonstrate nearly background limited direct detectors that are array compatible in the 0.2 to ~3 THz range
  - To show that refrigeration to 4 K with COTS closed-cycle cryorefrigerators is indeed a viable solution
  - Fully utilize the capabilities that are available for these sensitive direct detectors: hyperspectral operation at minimum front-end cost
- Our medium term goals:
  - Demonstrate passive video-rate operation with scanned linear arrays
- ...and long term:
  - Cryogenic multiplexers
  - Large format 2D arrays



#### Motivation: Concealed Weapons Detection at a stand-off distance

Millimetre & THz imaging identified as one possible solution to the detection of concealed weapons & explosives at a stand-off distance of several meters
Non-metallic weapons onboard airplanes
Explosive devices with little metal content
Sheet explosives





MilliLab

#### CWD Imagers are out in the market - why bother?

- Low energy X-ray backscatter (Rapiscan Systems Secure-1000)
- Exquisite image quality
- BUT:

MilliLab

- Even though the ∆ dose is extremely small, still ionizing radiation
- Image quality can in fact be too good - privacy concerns
- Lacks stand-off capability
- Slow throughput





IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

# THz/MMW Radiometry: technology matrix

• Context: **Passive** kilopixel imaging at video rates at mm/sub-mm waves



# **Figures of Merit**

- For direct (incoherent) detectors, typically Noise Equivalent Power (NEP) [W/Hz<sup>1/2</sup>]
- $\implies \text{SNR} = \frac{\eta P_{sig}}{NEP_e} \sqrt{2\tau_{\text{int}}}$
- For passive detection of thermal (continuum) targets, Noise Equivalent Temperature Difference (NETD) is most useful (includes detection bandwidth)
  - Typically assumes 30 ms integration time



# Detection principle of concealed objects:

- Emissivity of human skin ~50 % @ 100 GHz (close to 1 at higher frequencies)
- Metallic objects almost perfectly reflecting, other materials fall between perfect reflectors/absorbers
- Clothing materials ~transparent at mmw frequencies
- A radiometric temperature contrast between the background (body) and the object, which reflects the temperature of the surroundings
- If surroundings at body temperature, no contrast - illumination required
- Figure of merit of the radiometer: Noise Equivalent Temperature Difference (Radiometric resolution) [K]





arttu.luukaner

# Millimetre-wave imaging vs. submillimetre (or THz) imaging

- Optimum operating frequency for CWD determined by several factors:
  - Range
  - Spatial resolution
  - Thermal (or power) resolution
  - Target scenario (thickness of clothing materials etc)
  - Bandwidth
- Higher frequencies:
  - better spatial resolution for a given aperture size (1 m considered max. practical)
  - Most typical clothing materials transmit well up to ~0.6 THz
  - Atmospheric attenuation not an issue at short ranges (~<10 m) For longer ranges, operation at atmospheric windows necessary
- For stand-off CWD at ~10-50 m, optimum f~0.6 THz
- Limited technology options available



#### Outdoors passive millimetre wave (100 GHz or below) imagery

- Outdoors contrasts in the mmw scene can be very large (cold sky vs. ground ~200 K)
- Contrast between body & concealed weapons ~10 K
- Sky/ground provides 'illumination' to the scene--> bi-modal illumination
- Sufficient sensitivity of passive radiometers ~1-5 K
- Sky is like a giant cold lamp that illuminates the scene; Instead of being emitted by the person, detected signal is due to the reflection from surroundings

SKY~100 K





# Millimeter wave outdoors images (Qinetiq, UK)









IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

#### Indoors passive millimetre wave imagery

- Contrasts at max ~(37-20) K~15 K, with losses much less
- One tenth of available signal power as compared to outdoors imaging
- With losses in clothing materials, contrast between a weapon and the body ~ 1 K or less
- Required NETD 0.5 K or less
- Remedies (for existing detector technology)
  - Active illumination (lack of sources!)
    - Oscillators
    - Noise sources
  - "passive" illumination
    - Artificial enhancement of the scene contrast by a large blackbody, a window through the ceiling, etc
- All illumination schemes require "angle diversity"





#### Passive mm-wave imaging is old-hat, isn't it ?

- Single pixel scanned image
- 30 minutes acquisition time
- Switched heterodyne receiver, scanned across the target (8 pixels)
- Technology transfer from millimetrewave astronomy to the airport...?

• 1995: Millitech catalog

MilliLab





# Passive mm-wave imaging is old-hat, isn't it ?

- •Second generation: TRW passive millimetre wave camera (1997)
- •1040 MMIC radiometers
- Unit cost >1 MUSD (production line, not prototype!)
- •Power consumption ~1 kW, water cooled
- •89 GHz, NETD (17 Hz) ~1 K
- InP HEMT- based MMIC low noise amplifiers remain expensive
  Frequency of operation limited by the availability of low noise transistors to ~250 GHz
- •Our philosophy: reduce front-end complexity by refrigeration

**AilliLab** 







#### Passive indoors imagery, Heterodyne/direct detection receivers

 Comparison: Indoors imagery by Millivision (a frame from a realtime movie)







IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

MilliLab

#### Fundamental limits for incoherent direct detection

- Assuming parameters:
  - $v_c$ =500 GHz
  - $\Delta v / v_c = 2/3$  (1 octave)
  - τ<sub>int</sub>=30 ms (video-rate)
- → Theoretically NETD =1.3 mK achievable
- However, in real-life also other sources of noise (e.g. atmosphere, scene clutter etc.)
- Only cryogenic direct detectors have the potential to reach this NETD



**/illiLab** 

#### **Bolometers - an introduction**

- Invented by Samuel Pierpoint Langley 1880
- "Detected a cow moving across the field at 1/4 mile away" using a platinum thermometer within a Wheatstone bridge
- Simple principle:

illiLat

- absorbed radiation (of any kind, really) causes variations in the temperature *T* of an isolated heat capacity *C*.
- Sensitive thermometer measures the temperature variation
- Steady-state change in temperature: ΔT=ΔP<sub>opt</sub>R<sub>th</sub>
- Thermal time constant  $\tau_{th}=R_{th}C$







#### **Bolometers - an introduction**

- Various methods of thermometry:
  - Resistive
  - Capacitive (e.g. pyroelectric devices)
  - Inductive
  - Mechanical
- Supercondutors: Thermometry at the S-N transition
- Cryogenic bolometers (T~300 mK or below) are the most sensitive direct radiation detectors that exist



IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

#### **Bolometers: Optical Coupling**



#### **Bolometers - an introduction**

- A thermally isolated, radiation absorbing lump of material: a bolometer
- Change  $\Delta P_{opt}$  in incident signal power results to a change  $\Delta T = \Delta P_{opt} R_{th}$  of the isolated element
- Add thermometry  $\rightarrow$  obtain  $\Delta P_{opt}$
- A thermally isolated termination of a lithographic antenna
- NEP of bolometers independent of frequency
  - In practive NETD improves with frequency
- Noise sources
  - Phonon (or thermal fluctuation) noise ∞T<sup>3/2</sup> (for W-F law limited thermal conductance in an isolated bridge)
  - Johnson noise
  - (1/f noise)
- Unique advantage over MMICs, diodes: bandwidth (even ∆f/f ~2 possible) due to the Bode-Fano Criterion

T.-L. Hwang, S. Schwarz, and D. Rutledge,

"Microbolometers for infrared detection," Appl. Phys. Lett. 34(11), pp. 773–776, 1979.

6. D. P. Neikirk, W. W. Lam, and D. B. Rutledge, "Farinfrared microbolometer detectors," International journal of infrared and millimeter waves 5(3), pp. 245–278, 1983.

7. D. P. Neikirk and D. B. Rutledge, "Air-bridge microbolometer for far-infrared detection," Appl. Phys. Lett. 44(2), pp. 153–125, 1984.





#### Bolometers as X-ray detectors

- Cryogenic thermal detectors currently hold the world record with respect to energy resolution at X-ray & Gammaray energies
- Example NIST Transition-edge microcalorimeter (~100 mK)
- ∆E<sub>FWHM</sub>=2.38 eV @ 5.89 keV
- But sub-kelvin operation essential (can not compete with photodiodes above a few kelvins)

Francesco Giazotto, Tero T. Heikkilä, Arttu Luukanen, Alexander M. Savin, and Jukka P. Pekola, *Thermal properties in mesoscopics: physics and applications from thermometry to refrigeration*, Reviews of Modern Physics, 78, 1, pp. 217-274 (2006)







Figure courtesy of Joel Ullom, NIST Quantum Electrical Metrology Division Boulder, CO

# What does sensitivity (NEP) coupled with bandwidth buy?

- Spectral features of solids & gases in stp are *broad*.
- Combination of a broadband bolometric detector & tunable filter → low resolution spectroscopy for materials identification
- Alternatively: Design "RGB" pixels
   that cover 3 or more bands in
- frequency

frequency





MilliLab

# THz imaging with superconducting antenna-coupled microbolometers: Unique capabilities

- Almost perfect frequency agility: can be used to construct full-"colour" imagers: use THz CVF or multi-colour arrays
- Possibility for spectral imaging for remote identification of concealed explosives
- Not limited to frequencies below ~300 GHz (as MMIC technologies currently are)



MilliLat IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

arttu.luukanen@vtt.fi

Kemp et al, Proc SPIE

# Superconducting Antenna-coupled microbolometers for passive THz imaging

- Broadband (0.1 1 THz lithographic antenna) on Si
- **Bolometer** material
  - Nb for 1st generation devices
  - NbN for 2nd generation
- Similar to a Transition Edge Sensor; but with a large temperature gradient
- V-bias + T-gradient  $\rightarrow$  phase separation
- Bias + RF dissipation (DC) takes place in the N state region, • some RF dissipated also in the superconducting region (gap varies across the bridge)
- Bias power modulates the size of the hot-spot  $\rightarrow$  modulation of  $R \rightarrow$  modulation of current through the bridge
- Electrical measurements in 2003; NEP\_=14 fW/Hz<sup>1/2</sup>
- Extremely simple to fabricate
- Speed requirement? Real time scanned imagery: 30 Hz  $\times$ 200 scan positions ~ 6 kHz







IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

arttu.luukanen@vtt.fi

 $36x1x0.05 (\mu m)^3$ 

suspended Nb

Bridge

# Radiation coupled through a Si substrate lens



#### The room-temperature read-out

- Readout architecture developed by VTT Technical Research Center of Finland (J. S. Penttilä, H. Sipola, P. Helistö, and H. Seppä, "Low-noise readout of superconducting bolometers based on electrothermal feedback," Superconductor Science and Technology 19(4), pp. 319–322, 2006.)
- External feedback circuit employed that provides constant V
- V-bias at frequencies above the electronics BW provided by an RC shunt
- Bias point set at the bottom of the V-I → large dV/dI allows for noise matching to a room temperature JFET (T<sub>N</sub>=4.7 K)
- COTS video-frequency electronics: Everything except the JFET can be integrated to an ASIC





#### Theory vs experiment

- Thermal behaviour really *very* simple to model
- Thermal conductance of Nb devices obtained from fit: 2 nW/K
- Implies a phonon-noise limited NEP of 10<sup>-15</sup> W/Hz<sup>1/2</sup>



$$I(V) = \frac{V}{R_N} \left[ 1 + \frac{2}{(p_0 + p_e - 1) + \sqrt{(p_0 + p_e + 1)^2 - 4p_0}} \right]$$
$$p_o = \frac{P_{opt}}{G(T_c - T_{bath})}, p_e = \frac{V^2}{R_N}G(T_c - T_{bath})$$

in the limit  $P_{opt} \rightarrow 0$  reduces to

$$I(V) = \frac{G\Delta T}{V} + \frac{V}{R_N}$$
$$L = \frac{G\Delta TR_N}{V^2}$$



IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

MilliLab

#### Theory vs experiment

- Thermal behaviour really *very* simple to model
- Thermal conductance of Nb devices obtained from fit: 2 nW/K

l(μA)

• Implies a phonon-noise limited NEP of  $10^{-15}$  W/Hz<sup>1/2</sup>

$$I(V) = \frac{V}{R_N} \left[ 1 + \frac{2}{(p_0 + p_e - 1) + \sqrt{(p_0 + p_e + 1)^2 - 4p_0}} \right]$$
$$p_o = \frac{P_{opt}}{G(T_c - T_{bath})}, p_e = \frac{V^2}{R_N}G(T_c - T_{bath})$$

in the limit  $P_{opt} \rightarrow 0$  reduces to

310106 Nb airbridge bolometer, chip 641El  
600  

$$T=2.7 K$$
  
 $T_c=8.7 K$   
 $Chi/2 = 2.5886E-13$   
 $R^{22} = 0.99998$   
 $V0 = 0.00001 \pm 1.3295E-6$   
 $Rn0 = 16.11463 \pm 0.03928$   
 $G = 2.6044E-8 \pm 2.9853E-10$   
 $DT = 6 \pm 0$   
 $alpha = 0.00032 \pm 8.112E-6$   
1  
 $V(mV)$   
 $WORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006$  arttu.luukanen@vtt.fi

$$I(V) = \frac{G\Delta T}{V} + \frac{V}{R_N}$$
$$L = \frac{G\Delta TR_N}{V^2}$$



# Optical characterization (Nb devices)

300

 I<sub>sig</sub> vs responsivity: very good qualitative agreement



#### Speed?

- Response to a heavily attenuated pulsed (100 ns) IMPATT -oscillator (95 GHz)
- Intrinsic time constant 1.2  $\mu s \ \rightarrow$  fast enough for scanning architectures



# NEP, NETD (Nb devices)



IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

#### Scanned single pixel imagery with Nb devices



# Examples of acquired images (single pixel, Nb device)

- General parameters:
  - Distance: 0.8–2 m
  - Spatial pixel size: ~ 4-8 mm square
  - Pixel integration time: 10 ms
  - Calibration: hot water & background average area
  - Clothing variations: cotton, polyester, windblocker jacket, thermal sweater
  - Concealed objects:
    - RAM (AN-72)
    - metal gun
    - ZrO<sub>2</sub> knife
- Measured fluctuation in smooth background of images
  - 200-500 mK depending on area and image
- Important measured temperature contrasts
  - 8K: concealed threat objects
  - 5K: zippers, thick clothing overlap
  - 0.5-1.5K: wrinkles/folds in clothes, i.e., clutter
- Observed spatial resolution
  - ~ 1 cm features plainly resolved











IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006



# Examples of acquired images (single pixel, Nb device)

- General parameters:
  - Distance: 0.8–2 m
  - Spatial pixel size: ~ 4-8 mm square
  - Pixel integration time: 10 ms
  - Calibration: hot water & background average area
  - Clothing variations: cotton, polyester, windblocker jacket, thermal sweater
  - Concealed objects:
    - RAM (AN-72)
    - metal gun
    - ZrO<sub>2</sub> knife
- Measured fluctuation in smooth background of images: 200 mK
- Important measured temperature contrasts
  - 8K: concealed threat objects
  - 5K: zippers, thick clothing overlap
  - 0.5-1.5K: wrinkles/folds in clothes, i.e., clutter
- Observed spatial resolution

MilliLab

• ~ 1 cm features plainly resolved









# **Effective frequency?**

- Averaged edge transition from background to target, along edge
  - Performed on several images, in horizontal and vertical orientations
- Result:
  - Slope of measured edge agrees with theory at f = 450 GHz
    - Upper half of measured data does not "ring", since the theory of diffraction from an edge does not include an optical system imaging the edge
    - Due to the PSF of an optical system, the ESF is a rounded step





# **Effective frequency?**

- Recent data obtained by Jon Bjarnason, Elliot Brown, UCSB, using their novel Er-based photomixer
- Effective frequency 446 GHz



NIST bolometer frequency response



### The THz Lab



# Bolometer optimization: from Nb to NbN

- Bolometers: improving thermal isolation improves performance
- In a vacuum-bridge: thermal resistance & DC resistance coupled via Wiedemann - Franz Law:  $G \approx L_0 T_c / R_N \rightarrow \text{NEP}_{\text{TEN}} = (4k_B T_c^3 L_0 / R_N)^{\frac{1}{2}}$
- But: can't increase  $R_{\rm N}$  indefinitely:
  - Increasing geometric inductance with aspect ratio
  - Need to match the antenna ( $Z_{a,}$ , real)  $\rightarrow$  coupling  $\eta = 4Z_a R_N / (Z_a + R_N)^2$
- NEP& Optimum  $R_N = 6Z_a$  (for a 75  $\Omega$  log-spiral = 450  $\Omega$ )
- Antenna impedance and bolometer NEP are coupled, *favours high impedance antennas*
- For an ideal 450  $\Omega$  device, optical NEP  $\approx 4 \cdot 10^{-15} \, W/Hz^{\frac{1}{2}}$  is possible ( $T_{\rm c}{=}10 \ {\rm K})$
- Square spiral antennas have higher impedance (250  $\Omega$ ) (E.R. Brown *et al*)
  - NEP<sub>opt</sub> $\approx 2 \cdot 10^{-15}$  W/Hz<sup>1/2</sup> achievable





#### NbN devices: improved matching to the antenna

- First processing run of NbN test detectors (only one mask layer!) in March 2006
- Good NbN has a T<sub>c</sub>=15 K; However, our NEP∝T<sub>c</sub><sup>3/2</sup> → we want *bad* NbN (high resistivity, T<sub>c</sub>~10 K)
- Fabricated films have a T\_c=11 K,  $\rho \approx 2-4 \text{ m}\Omega \text{cm}$



#### NbN experimental results

- I-V measurement: fitted value for G=1.4 nW/K ( κ=34 mW/(Km))
- Resistivity 4.4 m $\Omega$ cm (above T<sub>c</sub>)
  - Electronic thermal conductance (W-F: ~0.5 nW/K) < lattice</li>
- Thermal transport dominated by phonons





New material : NbN devices, optical characterisation

- Optical characterisation carried out recently jointly at NIST
- "Traditional" resistive (local Electrothermal FB) voltage bias (noise dominated by the amplifier noise)
- Direct optical NETD (30 ms) : ~20 mK
- Images of a bar target











IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

**MilliLab** 

#### Migration to a cryogen-free Pulse Tube refrigerator

- Oxford Optisat AC-V12 (utilising Cryomech PT403):
  - Air or water cooled compressor, 3.3 kW (~50 cm x 50 cm x 50 cm), single phase
  - Cold-head: 250 mW cooling power at 4 K
  - MTF >~ 20 000 hrs
- Interfacing to RT electronics:
  - Worst-case: 64 pixels require 256 wires to room temperature
  - Custom-made low thermal conductivity cryoflex, 50 traces each. Low cost snap-on connectors
- Verification of noise performance
  - Effect of vibrations
  - Effect of temperature variations
  - EMI compatibility

MilliLab





IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

# Some desirable features of Cryocoolers from the application standpoint

- Airport applications Minimum impact on the infrastructure:
  - Single phase power
  - 25 A Fusing
  - Minimum footprint
  - Preferably no water cooling required
- Other:
  - MTTF: 20 000 or more hrs
  - On-site service
  - Acoustic noise: Aircooled units likely above limits
  - EMI Compatibility
  - Transportability
  - Backup in the case of a power failure ?



Noise at preamp input





MilliLab

# Conceptual view of the passive THz imager



**MilliLab** 







# Conclusions

- Single pixels with 30 ms NETD below 20 mK demonstrated
  - Need less than 0.5 K NETD for passive indoors imagery; For a 128 pixel array, 200 scan locations/frame, 30 frames/second, scanned NETD=0.25 K projected for these detectors;
- Efforts now really more on systems integration level; Some interesting detector physics still remains, though (where is the 1/f noise knee?)
- A passive approach that allows for
  - Broadband coarse-resolution photospectrometry in the 0.1 to ~5 THz band (similar detectors demonstrated all the way to 30 THz)
  - Low production cost of the imaging arrays
  - Nearly flat cost vs pixel number curve
- Chicken & Egg problem with cryocoolers: At present, a limited market volume keeps unit cost high (~25 k\$)
- Potentially a *very* large cryocooler market





# Conclusions (2)

- Millimetrewave imaging is superior in terms of range (negligible atmospheric attenuation), but existing technologies require illumination when operated indoors
- Cryogenic microbolometers have the potential for truly passive imaging (indoors/outdoors) with lower system cost as compared to MMIC based technologies
- Major technology need: cryogenic MUX for large format 2D arrays
- MilliLab, VTT, Oxford Instruments Analytical & Rapiscan Systems collaborating within a new program towards a spectral real-time imager based on the bolometer technology (TEKES); Includes collaboration with NIST, Boulder (Erich Grossman)
- If we can show that cryogenic detectors can solve the CWD problem with lower cost, better sensitivity, better specificity and that it is a practical solution we have a winner





# Backup





IWORID-8, Pisa 2.7.2006

Security and Medical Market Volume (M€)	Europe	World	% Europe
Security cameras - Civil	19.87	34.88	56.96%
Security cameras - Military	265.88	762.12	34.89%
Security - public places except airports	1 075.58	2 417.30	44.50%
Security - airports people	9.04	35.75	25.29%
Security - airports carry ons	18.08	71.51	25.29%
Security - airports checked ins	584.61	1 895.54	30.84%
Medical - Ambulatory	62.74	135.25	46.39%
Medical - Clinical	58.68	126.49	46.39%
Medical - Imagery	265.91	573.26	46.39%
Total	2 360.39	6 052.10	39.00%

Market study by Peter de Maagt, ESA-ESTEC

